

Arthur J. Burke (*pro hac vice*)
Anna M. Kozlowski (*pro hac vice*)
DAVIS POLK & WARDWELL LLP
450 Lexington Avenue
New York, New York 10017
(212) 450-4000
arthur.burke@davispolk.com
anna.kozlowski@davispolk.com

Sean P. McConnell (NJ #31352009)
Sarah O’Laughlin Kulik (NJ #110942014)
DUANE MORRIS LLP
30 S. 17th Street
Philadelphia, PA 19380
(215) 979-1947
spmccConnell@duanemorris.com
sckulik@duanemorris.com

*Counsel for Defendants DSM-Firmenich
AG, Firmenich International SA, and
Firmenich SA*

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY**

| | |
|--|---|
| IN RE FRAGRANCE DIRECT PURCHASER ANTITRUST LITIGATION | Civil Action No. 23-cv-02174 (WJM)(JSA) |
| IN RE FRAGRANCE INDIRECT PURCHASER ANTITRUST LITIGATION | Civil Action No. 23-cv-03249 (WJM)(JSA) |
| IN RE FRAGRANCE END-USER PLAINTIFF ANTITRUST LITIGATION | Civil Action No. 23-cv-16127 (WJM)(JSA) |
| | ORAL ARGUMENT REQUESTED <i>Document electronically filed</i> RETURN DATE: July 15, 2024 |

**NOTICE OF FIRMENICH FOREIGN DEFENDANTS’
MOTION TO DISMISS FOR
(1) INSUFFICIENT SERVICE OF PROCESS AS TO FIRMENICH SA
AND (2) LACK OF PERSONAL JURISDICTION**

To:

**CARELLA, BYRNE, CECCHI,
OLSTEIN, BRODY & AGNELLO,
P.C.**

James E. Cecchi
5 Becker Farm Road
Roseland, New Jersey 07068

*Liaison Counsel for Direct Purchaser
Plaintiffs and the Proposed Class*

HAUSFELD LLP

Scott Martin
33 Whitehall Street, 14th Floor
New York, NY 10004

*Counsel for Direct Purchaser Plaintiffs
and the Proposed Class*

HAUSFELD LLP

Hilary K. Scherrer (*pro hac vice*)
888 16th Street NW, Suite 300
Washington, DC 20006

*Co-Lead Counsel for Direct Purchaser
Plaintiffs and the Proposed Class*

HAUSFELD LLP

Katie R. Beran
325 Chestnut Street, Suite 900
Philadelphia, PA 19106

*Counsel for Direct Purchaser Plaintiffs
and the Proposed Class*

KOREIN TILLERY P.C.

Christopher M. Burke (*pro hac vice*)
707 Broadway, Suite 1410
San Diego, CA 92101

*Co-Lead Counsel for Direct Purchaser
Plaintiffs and the Proposed Class*

ROBERTS LAW FIRM US, PC

Mike Roberts
20 Rahling Circle
Little Rock, AR 72223

*Counsel for Direct Purchaser Plaintiffs
and the Proposed Class*

NUSSBAUM LAW GROUP, P.C.

Linda P. Nussbaum (*pro hac vice*)
1133 Avenue of the Americas
31st Floor
New York, NY 10036

*Co-Lead Counsel for Direct Purchaser
Plaintiffs and the Proposed Class*

NUSSBAUM LAW GROUP, P.C.

Susan R. Schwaiger
1133 Avenue of the Americas
31st Floor
New York, NY 10036

*Counsel for Direct Purchaser Plaintiffs
and the Proposed Class*

KOREIN TILLERY P.C.

Walter W. Noss (*pro hac vice*)
Yifan (Kate) Lv (*pro hac vice*)
707 Broadway, Suite 1410
San Diego, CA 92101

*Counsel for Direct Purchaser Plaintiffs
and the Proposed Class*

BURROUGHS LEGAL

Amelia F. Burroughs
P.O. Box 1465
Ferndale, CA 95536

*Counsel for Direct Purchaser Plaintiffs
and the Proposed Class*

KOREIN TILLERY LLC

Stephen Tillery
Rosemarie Fiorillo
Carol O’Keefe (*pro hac vice*)
505 North 7th Street, Suite 3600
St. Louis, MO 63101

*Counsel for Direct Purchaser Plaintiffs
and the Proposed Class*

RUPP PFALZGRAF, LLC

Arthur N. Bailey (*pro hac vice*)
111 West 2nd Street, Suite 1100
Jamestown, NY 14701

*Counsel for Direct Purchaser Plaintiffs
and the Proposed Class*

KOREIN TILLERY LLC

Labeat Rrahmani (*pro hac vice*)
205 N Michigan Avenue, Suite 1950
Chicago, IL 60601

*Counsel for Direct Purchaser Plaintiffs
and the Proposed Class*

**LIEFF CABRASER HEIMANN &
BERNSTEIN, LLP**

Jason Lichtman
Emily N. Harwell (*pro hac vice*)
250 Hudson Street, 8th Floor
New York, NY 10013

*Counsel for Direct Purchaser Plaintiffs
and the Proposed Class*

**FINE, KAPLAN AND BLACK,
R.P.C.**

Roberta D. Liebenberg
Gerard A. Dever
One South Broad Street, 23rd Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19107

*Counsel for Direct Purchaser Plaintiffs
and the Proposed Class*

BERGER MONTAGUE PC

Eric L. Cramer (*pro hac vice*)
Candice J. Enders (*pro hac vice*)
1818 Market Street, Suite 3600
Philadelphia, PA 19103

*Counsel for Direct Purchaser Plaintiffs
and the Proposed Class*

**STEYER LOWENTHAL
BOODROOKAS ALVAREZ &
SMITH LLP**

Allan Steyer (*pro hac vice*)
D. Scott Macrae (*pro hac vice*)
Alexander Kullar (*pro hac vice*)
235 Pine Street, 15th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94104

*Counsel for Direct Purchaser Plaintiffs
and the Proposed Class*

**LOCKRIDGE GRINDAL
NAUEN P.L.L.P.**

Brian D. Clark (*pro hac vice*)
Simeon A. Morbey (*pro hac vice*)
Arielle S. Wagner
100 Washington Avenue South
Suite 2200
Minneapolis, MN 55401

*Counsel for Direct Purchaser Plaintiffs
and the Proposed Class*

**LIEFF CABRASER HEIMANN &
BERNSTEIN, LLP**

Lin Y. Chan (*pro hac vice*)
Katherine Lubin Benson (*pro hac vice*)
Jules A. Ross (*pro hac vice*)
275 Battery Street, 29th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94111-3339

*Counsel for Direct Purchaser Plaintiffs
and the Proposed Class*

EDELSON LECHTZIN LLP

Marc H. Edelson (*pro hac vice*)
411 S. State Street, Suite N-300
Newtown, PA 18940

*Counsel for Direct Purchaser Plaintiffs
and the Proposed Class*

GRABAR LAW OFFICE

Joshua H. Grabar (*pro hac vice*)
One Liberty Place 1650 Market Street
Suite 3600
Philadelphia, PA 19103

*Counsel for Direct Purchaser Plaintiffs
and the Proposed Class*

**LAW OFFICES OF MICHAEL D.
FITZGERALD**

Michael D. Fitzgerald
1 Industrial Way West, Unit B
Eatontown, NJ 07724
P.O. Box 1067
Oakhurst, NJ 07755

*Liaison Counsel for End-User
Plaintiffs and the Proposed Class*

ROBINS KAPLAN LLP

Kellie Lerner
1325 Avenue of the Americas,
Suite 2601
New York, New York 10019

*Co-Lead Counsel for End-User
Plaintiffs and the Proposed Class*

**SPECTOR ROSEMAN &
KODROFF, PC**

William Caldes
Diana J. Zinser (*pro hac vice*)
Cary Zhang
2001 Market Street, Suite 3420
Philadelphia, PA 19103

*Counsel for End-User Plaintiffs and
the Proposed Class*

**FREED KANNER LONDON &
MILLEN, LLC**

Kimberly A. Justice (*pro hac vice*)
923 Fayette Street
Conshohocken, PA 19428

*Co-Lead Counsel for End-User
Plaintiffs and the Proposed Class*

ROBINS KAPLAN LLP

Benjamin D. Steinberg (*pro hac vice*)
Ellen G. Jalkut (*pro hac vice*)
Jordan B. Finkel (*pro hac vice*)
1325 Avenue of the Americas, Suite
2601
New York, New York 10019

*Counsel for End-User Plaintiffs and
the Proposed Class*

**FREED KANNER LONDON &
MILLEN LLC**

Robert Wozniak
Nia-Imara Binns
100 Tri-State International Drive,
Suite 128
Lincolnshire, IL 60069

*Counsel for End-User Plaintiffs and
the Proposed Class*

ADEMI LLP

Shpetim Ademi
3620 East Layton Avenue
Cudahy, Wisconsin 53110

*Counsel for End-User Plaintiffs and
the Proposed Class*

MCCUNE LAW GROUP

Dana R. Vogel
Christopher M. Sloom
2415 E. Camelback Rd., Suite 850
Phoenix, AZ 85016

*Counsel for End-User Plaintiffs and
the Proposed Class*

NEMATZADEH PLLC

Justin S. Nematzadeh (*pro hac vice*)
101 Avenue of the Americas, Suite 909
New York, NY 10013

*Counsel for End-User Plaintiffs and
the Proposed Class*

**REINHARDT, WENDORF &
BLANCHFIELD**

Garrett D. Blanchfield, Jr. (*pro hac
vice*)
222 So. 9th Street, Suite 1600
Minneapolis, MN 55402

*Counsel for End-User Plaintiffs and
the Proposed Class*

**LITE DEPALMA GREENBERG
& AFANDOR, LLC**

Joseph J. DePalma
Catherine B. Derenze
570 Broad Street, Suite 1201
Newark, NJ 07102

*Liaison Counsel for Indirect Purchaser
Plaintiffs and the Proposed Class*

**LITE DEPALMA GREENBERG
& AFANADOR, LLC**

Mindee J. Reuben
Steven J. Greenfogel
1515 Market Street - Suite 1200
Philadelphia, PA 19102

*Liaison Counsel for Indirect Purchaser
Plaintiffs and the Proposed Class*

**CUNEO, GILBERT & LADUCA
LLP**

Daniel Cohen (*pro hac vice*)
Blaine Finley
Cody McCracken (*pro hac vice*)
Lissa Morgans (*pro hac vice*)
4725 Wisconsin Ave., NW, Suite 200
Washington, DC 20016

*Co-Lead Counsel for Indirect
Purchaser Plaintiffs and the Proposed
Class*

**CUNEO, GILBERT & LADUCA
LLP**

Michael J. Flannery (*pro hac vice*)
Two City Place Drive, Second Floor,
St. Louis, MO 63141

*Co-Lead Counsel for Indirect
Purchaser Plaintiffs and the Proposed
Class*

GUSTAFSON GLUEK PLLC

Michelle Looby (*pro hac vice*)
Daniel E. Gustafson (*pro hac vice*)
Daniel C. Hedlund (*pro hac vice*)
Frances Mahoney Mosedale (*pro hac
vice*)
Bailey Twyman-Metzger (*pro hac
vice*)
120 South Sixth Street, Suite 2600
Minneapolis, MN 55402

*Co-Lead Counsel for Indirect
Purchaser Plaintiffs and the Proposed
Class*

GUSTAFSON GLUEK PLLC

Dennis J. Stewart (*pro hac vice*)
600 W. Broadway, Suite 3300
San Diego, CA 92101

*Co-Lead Counsel for Indirect
Purchaser Plaintiffs and the Proposed
Class*

TOSTRUD LAW GROUP, P.C.

Jon A. Tostrud
Anthony M. Carter
1925 Century Park East
Suite 2100
Los Angeles, CA 90067

*Interim Producer Indirect Purchaser
Plaintiffs' Steering Committee*

BOIESBATTIN LLP

Timothy D. Battin
Christopher V. Le (*pro hac vice*)
4041 University Drive, 5th Floor
Fairfax, VA 22030

*Interim Producer Indirect Purchaser
Plaintiffs' Steering Committee*

ZIMMERMAN REED LLP

David M. Cialkowski (*pro hac vice*)
June P. Hoidal
Ian F. McFarland (*pro hac vice*)
1100 IDS Center
80 S. 8th St.
Minneapolis, MN 55402

*Counsel for the Indirect Purchaser
Plaintiffs and the Proposed Class*

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that on July 15, 2024, or such other time and date as set by the Court, Defendants DSM-Firmenich AG, Firmenich International SA, and Firmenich SA (the “Firmenich Foreign Defendants”) will move before the Honorable Judge William J. Martini, Judge of the United States District Court for the District of New Jersey, Martin Luther King Building & U.S. Courthouse, 50 Walnut Street, Newark, New Jersey 07102, for entry of an Order granting the Firmenich Foreign Defendants’ Motion to Dismiss Plaintiffs’ Consolidated Complaints for (1) Insufficient Service of Process as to Firmenich SA and (2) Lack of Personal Jurisdiction with prejudice.

PLEASE TAKE FURTHER NOTICE that, in support of the within motion, the Firmenich Foreign Defendants rely upon the accompanying Memorandum of Law in Support of the Firmenich Foreign Defendants’ Motion to Dismiss for (1) Insufficient Service of Process as to Firmenich SA and (2) Lack of Personal Jurisdiction and the Declaration of Laetitia Pictet.

PLEASE TAKE FURTHER NOTICE that a proposed form of Order is being submitted herewith.

Dated: April 8, 2024

DUANE MORRIS LLP

/s/Sean P. McConnell

Sean P. McConnell

Sarah O’Laughlin Kulik

30 S. 17th Street

Philadelphia, PA 19380

(215) 979-1947

pmcconnell@duanemorris.com

ckulik@duanemorris.com

DAVIS POLK & WARDWELL LLP

Arthur J. Burke (*pro hac vice*)

Anna M. Kozlowski (*pro hac vice*)

450 Lexington Avenue

New York, NY 10017

(212) 450-4000

arthur.burke@davispolk.com

anna.kozlowski@davispolk.com

*Counsel for Defendants DSM-Firmenich
AG, Firmenich International SA, and
Firmenich SA*

LOCAL RULE 11.2 CERTIFICATION

Pursuant to Local Civil Rule 11.2, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, the matter in controversy in this case is not the subject of any other action pending in any court, or of any pending arbitration or administrative proceeding. I am aware that if the foregoing is willfully false I am subject to punishment.

Dated: April 8, 2024

/s/Sean P. McConnell

Sean P. McConnell

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Sean P. McConnell, an attorney duly admitted to practice in this District, hereby certify that:

1. On April 8, 2024, I caused a true copy of the following documents to be filed and served by CM/ECF in accordance with the District of New Jersey's Rules on electronic service:
 - a. Notice of Firmenich Foreign Defendants' Motion to Dismiss for (1) Insufficient Service of Process as to Firmenich SA and (2) Lack of Personal Jurisdiction;
 - b. Memorandum of Law in Support of the Firmenich Foreign Defendants' Motion to Dismiss for (1) Insufficient Service of Process as to Firmenich SA and (2) Lack of Personal Jurisdiction;
 - c. Declaration of Laetitia Pictet in support of the Firmenich Foreign Defendants' Motion to Dismiss; and
 - d. Proposed Order Granting the Firmenich Foreign Defendants' Motion to Dismiss.

I certify that the foregoing statements made by me are true. I am aware that if any of the foregoing statements made by me are willfully false, I may be subject to punishment.

Dated: April 8, 2024

DUANE MORRIS LLP

/s/Sean P. McConnell

Sean P. McConnell
Sarah O’Laughlin Kulik
30 S. 17th Street
Philadelphia, PA 19380
(215) 979-1947
spmccConnell@duanemorris.com
sckulik@duanemorris.com

DAVIS POLK & WARDWELL LLP

Arthur J. Burke (*pro hac vice*)
Anna M. Kozlowski (*pro hac vice*)
450 Lexington Avenue
New York, NY 10017
(212) 450-4000
arthur.burke@davispolk.com
anna.kozlowski@davispolk.com

*Counsel for Defendants DSM-Firmenich
AG, Firmenich International SA, and
Firmenich SA*